

TOPIC 15

SIMON COMMISSION, NEHRU REPORT, 14 POINTS OF JINNAH

JINNAH'S DEHLI PROPOSALS MARCH 1927:

- 1: Sind should be separated from Bombay and should be constituted into an independent province.
- 2: Reforms should be introduced in the North-West Frontier Province and Baluchistan on the same footing as in any other province of India.
- 3: Reservation of seats according to the population for different communities in the Punjab and Bengal.
- 4: Muslims should be given 1/3rd representation in the Central Legislature.

THE SIMON COMMISSION 1927

- The government of India act 1919 stated that a commission was going to be set up after 10 years to enquire the working of the Montague Chelmsford Reforms.
- Conservative Government feared to lose power to the Labor part so it decided to bring date of Simon Commission forward.
- In 1927 a seven men committee was formed under the supervision of John Simon to consider India's situation. All of them were British. Composition of committee was considered insult in India. And for that reason immediate protest was raised from all the important political parties. When the Simon Commission arrived, the local masses welcomed it by with slogans of "Go back Simon!". All the major political parties of Sub-continent, except the Shafi League of Punjab, boycotted the Simon Commission.
- All parties decided to settle their differences & work in opposition to the Simon commission.
- In May 1928, Congress, ML, Liberals, Hindu Mahasaba & Sikh league met in all part conference to draft constitution which Indian people thought to govern their country and finally Nehru report was introduced.
- Motilal Nehru headed this committee. There were nine other members in this committee including two Muslims, **Syed Ali Imam and Shoab Qureshi.**

There were following recommendations on Commissions report:

- 1. The Diarchy system in the provinces should be abolished.*
- 2. The power of the central government and the provincial governors should be reduced.*
- 3. Federal system of government should be introduced in India.*
- 4. The right to vote should be extended to more people.*
- 5. The separation of Sindh was not granted.*
- 6. The demand of the frontier for equal status was also neglected.*

NEHRU REPORT 1928

The following were the recommendations advanced by the Nehru Report:

1. India should be given the status of a **dominion**.
2. There should be **federal form of government** in India.
3. India should have a parliamentary form of government.
4. There should be bi-cameral legislature.
5. There should be **no separate electorate** for any community.
6. System of weightage for minorities should be rejected.
7. Reservation of Muslim seats should not be maintained.
8. Muslims should enjoy **one-fourth** representation in the Central Legislature.
9. Sindh should be separated from Bombay.
10. The N. W. F. P. should be given full provincial status.
11. **Hindi** should be made the official language of India.

The recommendations of the Nehru Report went against the interests of the Muslim community. It was an attempt to serve Hindu predominance over Muslims. The Nehru Committee's greatest blow was the rejection of separate electorates. If the report had taken into account the Delhi Proposals, the Muslims might have accepted it. But the Nehru Committee did not consider the Delhi Proposals at all while formulating their report. The Muslims were asking for one-third representation in the center while Nehru Committee gave them only one-fourth representation. It is true that two demands of Muslims were considered in the Nehru Report but both of them incomplete. It was said that Sindh should be separated from Bombay but the condition of self-economy was also put forward. It demanded constitutional reforms in N. W. F. P. but Baluchistan was overlooked in the

report.

Of the two Muslim members of the Nehru Committee, **Syed Ali Imam** could attend only one meeting due to his illness and **Shoaib Qureshi** did not endorse views of the Committee on the issue of Muslim representation in legislature. Thus the Nehru Report was nothing else than a Congress document and thus totally opposed by Muslims of the Sub-continent. The Hindus under Congress threatened the government with a disobedience movement if the Nehru report was not implemented into the Act by December 31, 1929. This Hindu attitude proved to be a milestone in the freedom movement of the Muslims. It also proved to be a turning point in the life of Muhammad Ali Jinnah. After reading the Nehru Report, Jinnah announced a '**parting of the ways**' and introduced his famous **14 points**. The Nehru Report reflected the inner prejudice and narrow-minded approach of the Hindus.

JINNAH'S 14 POINTS 1929:

Quaid-i-Azam presented his famous Fourteen Points in 1929 to counter Nehru report. These points were as follows:

1. The form of the future constitution should be federal with the powers vested in the provinces.
2. Autonomy shall be granted to all provinces.
3. Adequate and effective representation of minorities in every province.
4. In the Central Legislative, Muslim representation shall not be less than one-third.
5. Right of separate electorate for Muslims.
6. Any territorial distribution that might at any time be necessary shall not in any way affect the Muslim majority in the Punjab, Bengal and the North West Frontier Province.
7. Full religious liberty.
8. No bill or any resolution shall be passed in any legislature if three-fourth of the members of that community oppose such a bill.
9. Sindh should be separated from the Bombay presidency.
10. Reforms should be introduced in the North West Frontier Province and Baluchistan on the same footing as in the other provinces.
11. Muslims should be given an adequate share, in all the services of the state.
12. Adequate safeguards for the protection of Muslim culture and for the protection and

promotion of Muslim education, language, religion, personal laws.

13. No cabinet, either central or provincial, should be formed without there being a proportion of at least one-third Muslim ministers.

14. No change shall be made in the constitution by the Central Legislature without the approval of Indian Federation.

KEY POINTS:

- Mr. Jinnah presented his 14 points at the annual meeting of Muslim League in 1929.
- These 14 points were given to safeguard & protect the interest of Muslims.
- The demand of separate electorate, establishment of province of Sindh, giving proper status to NWFP & Baluchistan were to be strengthen the Muslims majority areas & were important steps towards giving proper identity to the Muslim nation.
- The Nehru report had created a great deal of confusion in the Muslims who started thinking seriously for the attainment of a separate homeland for the Muslims.
- The 14 points showed the Muslims their eventual objective & destination.

Expected Question & Answers:

- Question No. 1:** why did Jinnah produce his 14 points in 1929? 7
June 2005.Q.3 b
- Question No. 2:** was the introduction of Jinnah's 14 points in 1929 the most important factor in the development of the Pakistan Movement between 1928 & 1935? Give reasons for your answer. 14
June 2006, Q. 3 c
- Question No.3:** why did Jinnah produce his 14 points in 1929? 7
Nov.2007 Q.3 b
- Question No.4:** The 14 points were M.Ali Jinnah's greatest achievement in the years 1929 to 1947, do you agree? Explain your answer. 14
June 2009, Q. 4 c
- Question No.5:** Describe the Nehru Report. 4
June 2011, Q.4 a
- Question No.6:** The declaration of the Day of Deliverance in 1939 was Muhammad Ali Jinnah's greatest achievement in the years 1929 to 1947.' Do you agree? Explain your answer. 14
Nov.2012 Q.3 c

Question No.7: In 1927 the British government set up a commission chaired by Sir John Simon as provided for under the terms of the 1919 Government of India Act. The commission was to look into the situation in India but none of its members was an Indian. This was considered an insult by the Congress party which decided to boycott the commission.

(a) What was the Nehru Report?

[4]

Nov 2014 Q.3 a

Answer to Questions No 1 & 3:

The recommendation of the Nehru report was a source of disappointments for the Muslims. Muslims leaders who had always been anxious to ensure the protection of Muslim interest could not remain silent. Its three main points rather demands were totally against the interest of the Muslims, like the demand of unitary form of government in India, Joint electorates & introduction of Hindi as national language.

Mr. Jinnah suggested three amendments in Nehru report which were rejected. Therefore Jinnah put forward the 14 points in answer to the Nehru report (Jinnah also called the Nehru report as the parting of the ways). These points were produced in order to protect the political rights of Muslims. These points were quite comprehensive & covered all aspects of Muslim demands at that time.

In the 14 points Jinnah demanded Federal form of government, provincial autonomy, separate electorate, effective representation of Muslims in assemblies & 1/3rd seats for Muslims in all cabinets. Creation of new Muslim provinces of Sind, NWFP, & Baluchistan was also demanded.

Jinnah's 14 points clearly reflected the demands, sentiments & aspirations of the Muslims. But as in the past, the congress did not give them any importance & instead determined to oppose them. Anyhow 14 points became the part of government of India act 1935 later on.